



ALI MUSTAFA YA'QUB: CRITICISM OF PROBLEMATIC HADITH AND ITS CONTRIBUTION TO THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE STUDY OF HADITH IN INDONESIA

Alfani Hidayat^{1*}, Faida Fidiani²

Universitas Islam Negeri Maulana Malik Ibrahim Malang

^{1*}alfanihidayat100@gmail.com, ²faida99@gmail.com

Abstract:

This article discussed Ali Mustafa Ya'qub's criticism of the popular hadiths in society and their contribution to the development of hadith studies in Indonesia. Ali Mustafa Ya'qub tested the authenticity of these problematic hadiths by combining sanad and matan criticism. The results of this study comprehended Ali Mustafa Ya'qub's method of understanding a hadith by referring to the hadith Takhrij, namely by referring to the work of Mahmud Thahhan. In addition, he also performed ijtihad independently in determining the quality of hadith, namely by looking at the opinions of mutaqqadimin, mutaakhhirin and contemporary scholars. Ali Mustafa Ya'qub's contribution to the study of hadith in Indonesia could be seen based on his critical attitude when he studied and criticized the work of orientalist, namely Ignaz Goldziher, Juynboll, Joseph Schact, and David Samuel Margolioth as well as scholars who went against the flow. He also verified the hadith and also founded the Darussunnah Islamic Boarding School in the hope that it would produce muhaddiths and become an asset in understanding hadith.

Keywords: Criticism, Hadith, Contribution, Development

Copyright (c) 2022 Alfani Hidayat, Faida Fidiani.

* Corresponding author: Alfani Hidayat

Email Address : alfanihidayat100@gmail.com (Malang, UIN Maulana Malik Ibrahim Malang)

Received: May 11, 2022; Revised: June 14, 2022; Accepted: June 15, 2022; Published: June 18, 2022

INTRODUCTION

The development of hadith that occurs throughout the world, including in Indonesia, continues to progress. As a result, until now many works have emerged as a result of the codification of hadith that was attempted by previous scholars as well as the emergence of various criticisms from orientalist scholars who highlight the authenticity of hadith. Likewise, in Indonesia, the study of hadith continues to develop.¹

Historically, at the beginning of the 17th century, a study of hadith in Indonesia was carried out based on the work of Abdurrauf al-Singkili with the title *al-Mawa'id al-Badi'ah* and *Syarh al-Arba'in al-Nawawiyah*. Then, several works emerged from the

¹ Azyumardi Azra, Jaringan Ulama' Timur Tengah dan Kepulauan Nusantara (Jakarta: Prenada Media, 2005), 205.

next generation of Shaykh Nawawi al-Bantani who wrote *Tanqih al-Qaul* and Shaykh Mahfudz Termas who wrote *Manhaj Dzawi al-Nazar*.²

Then, in 2016 Ali Mustafa Ya'qub has written several works, the first is "Kritik Hadith" which discusses the methods that can be used to validate a hadith. Then the next work entitled "Problematic Hadiths" in which it explains the hadiths that are spread in the community as many as 33 hadiths. It was through these works that he criticized a hadith.

Criticism is a response accompanied by an explanation and view of a work, whether it is good or bad.³ Meanwhile, hadith criticism is an assessment of a hadith in the form of good or bad with a purpose. The assessment is in the form of the quality of the hadith, whether authentic, *hasan* or *dha'if*. Hadith criticism can be called *naqd al-hadith* which means the authenticity test of the hadith.⁴

Regarding this, Mustafa Ya'qub argues that hadith criticism is a hadith checking by a friend to ensure that the hadith comes from the Prophet SAW and exists, not because of doubts to the narrator that he is lying. So, to be able to know whether a hadith is authentic or not, it is necessary to have a direct relationship to the Prophet Muhammad SAW by honest, fair, and taqwa narrators. In addition, there is also a need for *dhabit* (strong memory), no *illah* (disabled) and no syadz (irregularities). Hadith experts suggest that between one narrator and another it is necessary to meet between the two or live in the same period.⁵

There have also been previous works discussing the criticism of Mustafa Ya'qub's hadith, including one written by Rizki Syahrul Ramadhan where according to him the tendency of Ali Mustafa Ya'qub's hadith criticism method is to refer to classical and contemporary scholars. In addition, there is also the work of Impiala Kurnia and Istianah which discusses the views of Ali Mustafa Ya'qub regarding the orientalist criticism of Ignaz Goldziher and Joseph Schacht on hadith.

Therefore, this paper will examine Ali Mustafa Ya'qub's criticism of problematic hadiths and his contribution to the development of hadith studies in Indonesia.

RESEARCH METHODS

The method in this research examines the problem by searching, searching, and examining the material in the form of data from literature related to research titles, both in the form of books, laws, journals, and other sources relevant to the topic being discussed.⁶ The technique of collecting legal materials or secondary data in normative legal research is carried out using a literature study of legal materials, both primary legal materials, secondary legal materials, as well as tertiary legal materials and/or non-legal materials. In normative legal research, there are three types of secondary data collection methods, namely bibliography study, a document study, and record study⁷. To

² M. Rizki Syahrul Ramadhan, "Metode Kritik Hadits Ali Mustafa Yaqub; Antara Teori dan Aplikasi," *Nabawi*, 1 (September, 2020), 25-26.

³ "Kritik", <https://kbbi.web.id/kritik>, diakses tanggal 25 Maret 2021.

⁴ Hedhri Nadhiran, "Epistemologi Kritik Hadits," *Jurnal Ilmu Agama Mengkaji Doktrin Pemikiran dan Fenomena Agama*, 2 (Desember, 2017), 49.

⁵ Istianah dan Impala Kurnia, "Pandangan Ali Mustafa Yaqub tentang Kritik Orientalis terhadap Hadits," *Riwayah: Jurnal Studi Hadits*, 2 (2019), 234.

⁶ Lexy J. Moleong, *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif* (Bandung: PT. Remaja Rosda Karya, 2007), 9.

⁷ Muhaimin, *Metode Penelitian Hukum* (Mataram: Mataram University Press, 2020), 65.

read and edit research materials carefully on the topics studied to obtain consistent validity. This research is normative research. Research materials used are primary materials and secondary materials. Then for data collection, namely by analyzing books using data sources from the library, which include books, journals, and articles, as well as data analysis methods and descriptive methods.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

1. Biography of Ali Mustofa Yaqub

Ali Mustofa Yaqub was born on March 2, 1952, to a father named Yaqub and a mother named Zulaikha in Kemiri village, Subah, Kab. Batang, Central Java. The father is the founder of the Darussalam Islamic Boarding School, Kemiri. While his mother is a teacher at the *Pondok Pesantren*.⁸

After completing his education at the People's School (*Sekolah Rakyat*) and Madrasah Tsanawiyah in his hometown, Ali Mustofa Yaqub studied at the Seblak Islamic Boarding School in Jombang, East Java from 1966 to 1969. Then he continued his education in Tebuireng from 1969-1971. Then in 1972, he studied at Hasyim Asy'ari University, Faculty of Sharia on the orders of his father. He usually went straight to his dormitory at the Tebuireng Islamic Boarding School, Jombang, East Java and studied scriptures under the tutelage of kyai, including KH. Samsuri Badawi, KH. Adlan Ali, KH. Idris Kamali, KH. Al-Musnid and KH. Friend. He studied until 1975.⁹

In 1976, Mustofa Yaqub continued his education at the Shari'ah Faculty of the Imam Muhammad bin Saud Islamic University and graduated in 1980 with a License (Lc). Subsequently, he resumed his education and entered the department of Tafsir and Hadith at King Saud University and later received a master's degree. Then he continued his studies at the doctoral level at the University of Nizamia, India specializing in Islamic Law and then graduated in 2007-2008.¹⁰

In Indonesia, he became a lecturer. He teaches at the Institute of Qur'anic Sciences (IIQ), Institute for Higher Education of Al-Qur'an Sciences (PTIQ), Islamic Studies at the Istiqlal Mosque, and Syarif Hidayatullah State Islamic University.¹¹

2. Thoughts of Ali Mustofa Ya'qub

Thinking is a way, process and act of thinking.¹² Ali Mustofa thinks that innovation in worship is a practice for which there is no evidence so it is not called an act of *ijtihad* because of differences of opinion. For this reason, he did not agree that *dhikr* was called *bid'ah dhalallah*. In dealing with the differences between Indonesian clerics in the Salafi community and Saudi Arabian clerics, he prefers a moderate attitude and does not show an open attitude because according to him differences are commonplace. In addition, in understanding a hadith, he will first try to understand it textually. However, if this is not

⁸ Ali Mustofa Ya'qub, *Hadits-hadits Palsu Seputar Ramadan* (Jakarta: Pustaka Firdaus, 2003), 143.

⁹ Dewi Anggraeni, "Toleransi antar Umat Beragama Perspektif KH. Ali Mustofa Yaqub," *Jurnal Studi Al-Qur'an Membangun Tradisi Berfikir Qur'an*, 1 (2018), 62.

¹⁰ Miski, "Pemahaman Hadits Ali Mustofa Yaqub Studi atas Fatwa Pengharaman Serban dalam Konteks Indonesia," *Riwayah Jurnal Studi Hadits*, 1 (2016), 18.

¹¹ Muhammad Yunus, "Hadits tentang Arah Kiblat: Kritik Pemikiran Ali Mustofa Yaqub," *Jurnal Al-Irfani STAI Darul Kamal NW Kembang Kerang*, 1 (2020), 13.

¹² Rachmat Kriyanto, *Teknik Praktisi Riset Komunikasi* (Jakarta: Kencana Pranada Grop, 2007), 873.

possible, efforts to understand the hadith will be contextual. Textual here means *zhahir*, that is, they do not understand the purpose and intent, so they only stick to the literal text. Usually, these people share the balance between worship and custom. And for contextual understanding, which is the opposite of textual, namely by looking at the reasons for the emergence of a hadith, local and temporal, socio-cultural, and causal relationships.¹³

According to him, matters relating to mahdhah worship and the unseen are hadith that are understood contextually. Mahdhah worship is the relationship of creatures directly to Allah SWT such as prayer, fasting, pilgrimage, and others. As for the unseen, it is divided into 2, namely the relative unseen and the absolute unseen. The relative supernatural, such as people who have never visited New York City, considers the city to be unseen. But this is certainly different from some people who have visited. And for the absolute unseen, namely the existence of heaven, hell, the essence of God and the existence of the Day of Judgment.¹⁴ According to Ali Mustafa Yaqub contextual understanding is an understanding that explores the meaning of hadith (*al-fahm al-ma'nawi*). In using this method, seven components must be passed, namely: *majaz* in hadith, *takwil* in hadith, geography in hadith, Arabic culture in hadith, *asbab al-wurud* (background) of hadith, social conditions in hadith, and *'illat* (factor) that causes a law in hadith. And several things must be considered, namely: the contradictions of the hadith with the Koran, the contradictions of the hadith with other such hadiths, and the contradictions of the hadith with logic or human reason.¹⁵

3. The Motives of the Writing of Problematic Hadiths

The book entitled "Problematic Hadiths" written by Ali Mustafa Ya'qub tries to answer various questions about hadiths that develop and continue to circulate among the public. The people's questions mainly focus on the validity of the hadith. To answer whether it is valid or not, he is always serious in providing detailed and detailed explanations. He said:

"The detailed information certainly requires study, discussion, and even research on the hadiths they ask about. So so that the results of the study are known to more people, we then use the mass media to disseminate the results of the study."

At that time, he was indeed being given the mandate to take care of the Hadith Rubik / pulpit in AMANAH Jakarta magazine in the 1990s. Thus, the magazine contains a lot of discussion about hadith. This mass media is then used to disseminate the results of the study. Subsequently, his writings in various magazines were combined and published into a book entitled "Problematic Hadiths."¹⁶

According to Mustafa Ya'qub, when compared between authentic and fake hadiths, the hadiths that are spread in the community regarding fake hadiths have a smaller number than authentic hadiths. However, if this fake hadith is allowed to circulate, it can

¹³ Nasrullah Nurdin, "Prof Dr KH Ali Mustofa Ya'qub, MA, Muhaddis Nusantara Bertaraf Internasional," *Jurnal Lektur Keagamaan*, 1 (2016), 207-210.

¹⁴ Miski, "Pemahaman Hadits Ali Mustafa Yaqub Studi atas Fatwa Pengharaman Serban dalam Konteks Indonesia", 19-20

¹⁵ Syuhudi Ismail, *Hadis Nabi Yang Tekstual Dan Kontekstual Telaah Maani Tentang Ajaran Islam Yang Universal, Temporal Dan Lokal*, (Jakarta: Bulan Bintang, 1994), 7.

¹⁶ Ali Mustafa Ya'qub, *Hadits-Hadits Bermasalah* (Jakarta: Pustaka Firdaus, 2008), xi.

affect the number of authentic hadiths which are more numerous. So according to him, cleaning the small among the very large is an act that must be done.¹⁷

In his work entitled *Problematic Hadiths*, he examines various hadiths that are troubling many people. Sometimes a hadith that is well-known among the public becomes the basis used in practicing worship, but after being traced and researched, the hadith is fake. In addition, some hadiths are considered wrong by some people, even though the opposite is true, that is, they are valid. Some traditions are no longer used by the community because they are considered weak (*dha'if*), even though the hadith is still worthy of being used as a basis for practicing and leaving an action. This is because in the hadith, the contents are still supported by various other foundations that are stronger and do not contain severe ignorance¹⁸.

4. Methods of Criticism of Problematic Hadiths

Ali Mustafa Ya'qub's method in understanding a hadith is by referring to the Takhrij hadith, namely by referring to the work of Mahmud Tahhan in his book *Usul al-Takhrij wa Dirasah al-Asanid*. So that Mustafa Ya'qub in conducting the study, used the same general rule as Mahmud Tahhan, namely by combining the criticism of *sanad* and *matan*.¹⁹

Ya'qub not infrequently carried out independent *ijtihad* to provide an assessment of the quality of hadith, namely through reviewing various statements of *mutaqaddimin* scholars such as al-Tirmizi, Ibn Jauzi, and al-Baihaqi. Likewise with several *mutaakkhkhirin* scholars, namely al-Suyuthi, al-Manawi, Ibn Hajar, and Al-Manawi. Likewise, modern scholars include Syaikh Ahmad Shakir, Syaikh al-Arna'ut, and others²⁰ by comparing *jarh wa ta'dil* as mentioned above. If any discrepancies are found, they will be compared with *mutasyaddidun*, *mutawassitun*, and *mutasahhilun* scholars.²¹ So that it will be concluded about the hadith. The conclusion of Ali Mustafa Ya'qub is based on the views of hadith experts by tracing *mu'tabar* books. And then the conclusion will be seen whether it is authentic, *hasan*, or *dha'if*, where the *sanad* must be continued, the narrator must be fair and the *dhabit* and *matan* do not contain *illah* or *syaz*.²²

In analyzing the originality of hadith, Mustafa Ya'qub explores through comparisons of hadiths narrated by the Companions of the Prophet, comparisons of narrators with different periods, comparisons of hadiths narrated from one hadith teacher, comparisons of hadiths between one teacher and another, comparison of the hadith contained in books that have been written with other books or memorized hadith, as well as comparisons of hadith with verses of the Qur'an. This is done to know whether the hadith is valid or not²³.

¹⁷ Ya'qub, *Hadits-Hadits Bermasalah*, xii.

¹⁸ Ya'qub, *Hadits-Hadits Bermasalah*, xi-xii.

¹⁹ Nadhiran, "Epistemologi Kritik Hadits", 218-219.

²⁰ Adriansyah, "Shifting Paradigm" Pemahaman Hadits di Indonesia (Studi Interpretasi Kontekstual Ali Mustafa Ya'qub terhadap Hadits-Hadits Hubungan dengan Non-Muslim)," *Jurnal Agama Islam*, 2 (Desember, 2019), 220.

²¹ Nurdin, "Prof Dr KH Ali Mustofa Ya'qub, MA, Muhaddis Nusantara Bertaraf Internasional", 208.

²² Istianah dan Shofaussamawati, "Kontribusi Ali Mustafa Yaqub (1952-2016) dalam Dinamika Kajian Hadits di Indonesia," *Riwayah: Jurnal Studi Hadits*, 1 (2017), 11.

²³ Muhammad Qomarullah, "Pemahaman Hadits Ali Mustafa Yaqub dan Kontribusinya terhadap Pemikiran Hadits di Indonesia," *Al Quds Jurnal Studi Al-Quran dan Hadits*, 2 (2020), 394.

5. Problematic Hadith Applications

In Ali Mustafa Yaqub's work entitled Problematic Hadiths, 33 hadiths are described which consist of: (1) Seeking Knowledge Even in China; (2) Opinion dissimilarity is Rahmat; (3) Umara-Umara; (4) Poverty is close to disbelief; (5) Virtue and Prayer on the Night of Nishfu Sya'ban; (6) The beginning of Ramadan is Rahmat; (7) Performing the Hajj Using Haram Assets; (8) The existence of the Prophet Muhammad became the determinant of the creation of the world; (9) Worshiping Hajj and Pilgrimage to the Prophet's Grave; (10) Work For The World As If It Never Dies; (11) Muslims are divided into 73 groups; (12) Women Are the Pillars of the Country; (13) If you want the world or the hereafter, you must have knowledge; (14) Love of the Motherland Is One Part of Faith; (15) Whoever knows himself knows his Lord; (16) Humans imitate the personality of their leaders; (17) The Leftover Food of the Believer Heals; (18) In the environment of the Children of Israel, scholars are like prophets; (19) Miraculous Events Around the Birth of the Prophet SAW; (20) The Prophet SAW was greeted by a deer; (21) Don't Eat Until You Feel Hungry; (22) Commemorating the Birthday of the Prophet SAW.; (23) Qashidah Thala 'al-Badr To Welcome the Prophet SAW.; (24) Ramadan in a Whole Year; (25) Prayer of Tasbih; (26) Takabbur towards Arrogant People is Alms; (27) Number of Raka'at in Tarawih Prayers; (28) The sleep of a fasting person is worship; (29) The Month of Ramadan Depends on Zakat Fitrah; (30) Prayer with a Turban; (31) Happy for Ramadan; (32) 5 Things That Trigger the Cancellation of Fasting; and (33) 4 People Who Longing for Heaven.

The author will discuss some problematic hadiths along with an explanation of the hadith according to Ali Mustafa Ya'qub:

- Seeking Knowledge Even in China

This hadith is a popular hadith that reads:

أَطْلُبُوا الْعِلْمَ وَلَوْ بِالصِّينِ فَإِنَّ طَلَبَ الْعِلْمِ فَرِيضَةٌ عَلَى كُلِّ مُسْلِمٍ

Seek knowledge even in China, because seeking knowledge is obligatory for every Muslim.

If you look at the book of *al-Maqhasid al-Hasanah* belonging to al-Sakhawi which was previously stated by Ibn Hibban, this hadith is false *la ashla lahu* (false, false, has no basis). Meanwhile, according to Ibn Hibban, this hadith is a false, false and baseless hadith (*bathil la ashla lahu*) because the source of the hadith is Abu 'Atikah Tarif bin Sulaiman, where the scholars argue that he is a person who has no credibility as a hadith narrator.²⁴

The first Sanad of this hadith is Ahmad bin 'Abdullah - Maslamah bin al-Qasim - Ya'qub bin Ishaq bin Ibrahim al-'Asqalani - 'Ubaidillah bin Muhammad al-Firyabi - Sufyan bin 'Uyainah - al-Zuhri - Anas bin Malik - Prophet Muhammad SAW. Narrated by Ibn Abd al-Barr and al-Baihaqi in the book *Shu'aib al-Iman*. In this case, according to Imam al-Dzahabi, Ya'qub bin Ibrahim is a *kadzdzab* (liar).

Then the second chain of Ibn Karram - Ahmad bin Abdullah al-Juwaibari - al-Fadhl bin Musa - Muhammad bin 'Amr - Abu Salamah - Abu Hurairah - Prophet Muhammad SAW. Narrated by Ibn Karram in *al-Mizan* by al-Dzzahabi. In this case, Ahmad bin Abdullah is a forger of hadith.

²⁴ Ya'qub, *Hadits-Hadits Bermasalah*, 1-3.

In the book *al-Lisan*, Ibn Hajar al-Asqalani narrates the hadith with his narration from Ibrahim al-Nakha'i - Anas bin Abi Malik. Ibrahim said that he heard the hadith from Anas bin Malik. In this case, Ibrahim al-Nakha'i is a liar because Ibn Hajar al-'Asqalani says that Ibrahim never heard anything from Anas bin malik²⁵.

Meanwhile, according to Prof. Dr. Al-Din, the hadith "Seeking Knowledge Even in China" is not able to change its quality to *hasan li ghairih* from *dha'if*, and he also said if he did not make sure that the hadith was very weak (*dha'if syadid*). In practice, the hadith cannot be implemented as a basis for sharia, aqidah, akhlaq, and *fadhail al-a'mal*²⁶.

- If you want the world or the hereafter, you must have knowledge

This hadith is found in the initial juz, page 12 by Imam al-Nawawi in the book *al-Majmu 'Syarh al-Muhaddzab* and does not come from the words of the Prophet Muhammad, but from the words of Imam al-Shafi'i. The full statement is as follows:

قَالَ رَحِمَهُ اللهُ طَلَبُ الْعِلْمِ أَفْضَلُ مِنْ صَلَاةِ النَّافِلَةِ وَقَالَ : مَنْ أَرَادَ الدُّنْيَا فَعَلَيْهِ بِالْعِلْمِ وَمَنْ أَرَادَ الْآخِرَةَ فَعَلَيْهِ بِالْعِلْمِ

Imam al-Shafi'i rahimahullah said "Seeking knowledge is more important than the sunnah prayer." And said, "Whoever wants the world he must have the knowledge and whoever wants the hereafter he must have knowledge."

Imam Shafi'i's expression was included by Imam al-Nawawi in *فَصْلٌ فِي نَوَاضِرٍ مِنْ حِكْمِ الشَّافِعِيِّ وَأَخْوَالِهِ* namely the discussion of things that are foreign to the wisdom of al-Shafi'i and his behavior/condition. However, it still cannot be proven whether it is an expression of Imam al-Shafi'i or not. This is because there is no reference mentioned by Imam al-Nawawi. On the other hand, if you look at the death of both, the death of Imam al-Shafi'i is in 204 H, while the death of Imam al-Nawawi is in 676 H. So the distance between al-Nawawi and al-Shafi'i is very far.

According to him, preachers and missionaries use this expression to always fight the ignorance of Muslims, but not by denying the Prophet Muhammad, where the Prophet did not say that. Likewise, those who convey the message have not found the truth. However, it would be foolish to claim that these words were the words of the Prophet Muhammad. Ignorance cannot fight ignorance.²⁷

To explain the hadiths that are familiar to the community, Ali uses a historical approach and a language approach to make it easy for the community to accept and understand. Because interpretation is needed in finding a hadith that is more lively, mobile, and able to adapt to the conditions of society.²⁸

- Loving the Country Is Part of Faith

According to some people, this hadith can increase the sense of nationality and foster the spirit of patriotism. The text of this hadith is:

²⁵ Ya'qub, *Hadits-Hadits Bermasalah*, 4.

²⁶ Ya'qub, *Hadits-Hadits Bermasalah*, 5.

²⁷ Ya'qub, *Hadits-Hadits Bermasalah*, 72-73.

²⁸ Istianah dan Shofaussamawati, "Kontribusi Ali Mustafa Yaqub (1952-2016) dalam Dinamika Kajian Hadits di Indonesia", 21.

Loving the homeland is part of faith.

This hadith is known in the community, but this hadith is fake according to the agreement of the scholars. However, Imam Suyuti said that he could not find the text of the hadith. The same statement was stated by al-Sakhawi, which he stated even though according to al-Sakhawi the essence of the hadith was true. al-Suyuti and al-Sakhawi *lam aqif 'alaihi* is a term for "*mawdhu hadith*". Likewise, Imam al-'Ajluni, the author of the book "*al-Masyariq*" quoted by Imam al-'Ajluni, also confirmed that such a hadith is *mawdhu*. But some interpret *al-wathon* as a return to Allah, and some interpret *al-jannah*, namely the holy city of Makkah al-Mukarramah. However, even if the substance is authentic, it still cannot change the expression into an authentic hadith, because if the hadith is attributed to the Prophet Muhammad, it is still false. So, it would be nice if a valid substance should be called a pearl or a word of wisdom to be safe from the threat of going to hell.²⁹

- Ulama-Umara

Imam Ghazali in his book *Ihya Ulum al-Din* in full:

صِنْفَانِ مِنْ أُمَّتِي إِذَا صَلَحَا صَلَحَ النَّاسُ وَإِذَا فَسَدَ النَّاسُ, الْأُمَرَاءُ وَالْعُلَمَاءُ

There are two groups of my Ummah, if both are good, then all humans are good, and if both are corrupt, then all humans are corrupted. In that group are the umara and scholars.

In the book *Al-Mughni 'an Haml al-Asfar fi Takhrij ma fi al-Ihya min al-Anbar* belonging to Al-Hafidz Zein al-Din al-'Iraqi, this hadith sanad is a *dha'if*. Likewise, Imam al-Suyuti has the same opinion, namely *dha'if*. While this hadith is false according to Sheikh al-Albani. The rawi and sanad in this hadith originate from Muhammad bin Ziyad al-Yasykuri who was a liar. Likewise, according to Ibn Hibban al-Busti, al-Yasykuri is a person who falsifies hadith in the name of a trusted person. 'Amr bin Zurarah once told Imam al-Bukhari that Muhammad bin Ziyad was accused of being a forger of hadith. So that this hadith is not only *dha'if*, but also weak. According to Yaqub, by looking at the chain alone, this hadith is fake.³⁰

- Virtue and Prayers on the Night of *Nishfu Sya'ban*

The hadith regarding the privilege on the night of *nishfu sya'ban* is about 9 hadiths, where there is a hadith that is *dha'if jiddan*. Among them:

1) Hadith of Ali bin Abi Talib

عن علي رضي الله عنه قال قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم : إذا كانت ليلة النصف من شعبان فقوموا ليلها و صوموا نهارها فإن الله ينزل فيها لغروب اشمس إلى السماء الدنيا فيقول ألا من مستغفر فأغفرله , ألا مسترزق فأرزقه ألا مبتلى فأعافيه, ألا كذا, ألا كذا, حتى يطلع الفجر

²⁹ Ya'qub, *Hadits-Hadits Bermasalah*, 74-76.

³⁰ Ya'qub, *Hadits-Hadits Bermasalah*, 14-15.

It was narrated from Ali Radhia Allahu'Anhu, that the Messenger of Allah (SAW) said, "When the night of *Nisfu Sha'ban* comes, pray that night and fast the next day. Allah will descend and say "Is there anyone who asks forgiveness so that I forgive him, is there someone who asks for sustenance and I give it, is there someone who is sick and asks to be healed so that I will heal him. Did anyone ask for this and that." Allah does it from sunset until dawn.

This hadith was narrated by Imam Ibn Majah. Then found Abu Bakr bin Muhammad bin Abi Sabrah al-Quraish as a narrator in his sanad. Scholars think that Abu Bakr bin Abi Sabrah al-Quraish is someone who falsifies hadith and is a liar. Meanwhile, Imam al-Bukhari said that his hadith is munkar because there are many immoralities. He is also considered a liar when narrating the hadith by Imam al-Nasa'i. So this hadith is categorized as *maudhu'*, *munkar* or *matruk*.³¹

2) Hadith of Mu'adz bin Jabal

عن معاذ بن جبل رضي الله عنه عن النبي صلى الله عليه و سلم قال : يطلع الله إلى جميع خلقه ليلة النصف من شعبان فيغفر لجميع خلقه إلا لمشرك أو مشاحن

It was narrated from Mu'adz, from the Messenger of Allah, who said, "On the night of Nisfu Sha'ban, Allah will look at all His creatures and then forgive them except those who are polytheists or are hostile to others."

In Mu'jam al-Ausath, this hadith is one of the hadiths narrated by Imam al-Thabrani.

- 3) Hadith with the editorial number 2 narrated by al-Baihaqi and Imam al-Bazzar. According to al-Mundziri the sanad is good.
- 4) Hadith with text like number 2 narrated by Imam Abu Musa al-Ash'ari which was then narrated again by Imam Ibn Majah. Meanwhile, in the sanad, there are 2 narrators who, according to Imam al-Bushairi, are similarly *dha'if*.
- 5) Hadith with text similar to the above, narrated by Imam Ahmad bin Hanbal from Abdullah bin 'Amr and this hadith is of weak quality according to al-Mundziri is *layyin* (weak)
- 6) Hadith with similar text number 2, narrated by al-Baihaqi from Katsir. According to him, the sanad is *mursal jayyid*.
- 7) Hadith with somewhat the same text, narrated by Imam Baihaqi from Abu Tsa'labah and Imam al-Thabrani. The hadith sanad is *mursal jayyid*, referring to the opinion of Al-Baihaqi,
- 8) Hadith with the same meaning as above, narrated by Imam al-Tirmidhi. This hadith is a *munqathi'*.
- 9) Hadith with its meaning as above, narrated by al-Baihaqi from 'Aisyah RA. According to him, the sanad is *mursal jayyid*.

So when you look back, of the 9 hadiths, the first hadith is *maudhu'* quality, while the 2nd to 9th hadiths are *dha'if*. If a *dha'if* hadith is narrated in another chain, according

³¹ Ya'qub, *Hadits-Hadits Bermasalah*, 25-26.

to the science of hadith, its quality can be a *Hasan li Ghairih Hadith*, provided that it is not caused by a lying narrator or immoral person.³²

In the book of *al-Maudhu'at* by Ibn Al-Jauzi, *Tanzih al-Shari'ah al-Marfu'ah 'an al-Akhbar al-Syani'ah* by Ibn Araq al-Kannani it is stated that worship on the night of nishf sya'ban is fake hadith. The hadith reads:

من صلى ليلة النصف من شعبان ثنتي عشر ركعة يقرأ من كل ركعة قل هو الله أحد ثلاثين مرة لم يخرج حتى يرى مقعده من الجنة ويشفع في عشرة من أهله كلهم قد وجبت له النار

Those who pray on the night of Nisfu Sha'ban a total of 12 rak'ahs and each rak'ah recites Surah Al-Ikhlās a total of 30 times, then he will not leave the world but he will be shown his residence in heaven and will be given the right of intercession for him to all his relatives who his residence in hell has been determined.

This hadith is *dha'if* according to Imam as-Suyuti due to unidentified narrators and very weak narrators, namely Baqiyah and Laits. So in this case, the hadith regarding the privilege on the night of *nishfu sya'ban* is *hasan*, while the hadith about praying at that *nishfu sya'ban* is *maudhu'*.³³

This explanation has represented several hadiths described by Ya'qub in criticizing the hadiths that became public unrest. According to the study of hadith science, the emergence of false hadith is due to disproportionate charity and reward. Therefore, to be able to find the fake of a hadith, namely through the matan and sanad of a hadith. For this reason, a more thorough attitude towards knowledge of the correct arguments is needed in worship. Because worshiping based on false hadith and spreading false hadith is something that is opposed in Islam³⁴.

6. Ali Mustafa Ya'qub's Contribution to the Development of Hadith Studies in Indonesia

His contribution can be seen from his critical attitude when he examines and criticizes the works of the orientalis, namely Ignaz Goldziher, Juynboll, Joseph Schacht, and David Samuel Margoliot.³⁵ For Ignaz Goldziher, the Islamic concept of sunnah is a revision of the customs that occurred at that time, although it does not strengthen in the overall sense. So, for Goldziher, the hadith has no purity at all, although it still has a strong position as a source of Islamic teachings.³⁶ Goldziher's opinion is categorized as an opinion that can mislead religion, especially for new converts to Islam, then also for ordinary Muslims who are easily influenced and become shaky in their beliefs. Then Joseph Schacht claimed that the complete sanad that led to the Messenger of Allah was the creation or addition of the fuqaha' in the Tabi'in era and after, who wanted to strengthen their madhhab by making it a hadith of the Prophet. So according to him the source of the hadith is tabi'in then developed to the previous generation which ended in

³² Ya'qub, *Hadits-Hadits Bermasalah*, 28.

³³ Ya'qub, *Hadits-Hadits Bermasalah*, 29-30.

³⁴ Waskito, *KH. Ali Mustafa Ya'qub Menjaga Sunnah Mengawal Dakwah* (Jakarta: Pustaka Al-Kautsar: 2016).

³⁵ Istianah dan Impala Kurnia, "Kritik Orientalis terhadap Hadits", 245-246.

³⁶ Abdul Karim, "Pemikiran Orientalis Terhadap Kajian Tafsir Hadis," *Addin*, 2 (2013), 323.

the prophet SAW.³⁷ This is a fabricated and unscientific statement and thought which is a vile slander based solely on hatred

According to him against Goldziher, he had changed the text associated with al-Zuhri. He also denied that according to Schacht, fiqh emerged after the al-Sha'bi period because Islamic jurisprudence or law had been well-known since the time of the Prophet Muhammad and was the result of the ijihad of the mujtahids. ³⁸ Not only that, but he also criticized the great cleric, namely Shaykh Muhammad Nasruddin al-Albani. According to him, Albani copied the hadith that had been authenticated by the hadith scholars, so he argued that Albani was against the current. ³⁹

In addition, the efforts made by Ali Mustafa Ya'qub in responding to the problems that are present in the community are by verifying which ones are hadith and which are not hadiths through his works. ⁴⁰ M. Azami also demands to respond and criticize the methods and theories developed by Joseph Schacht, that according to him the selection of books in the study of the sanad conducted by Schacht included the book *Muwaththa'*, the work of Imam Malik, the *muwaththa'* by Imam Muhammad as-Syaibani and *al-Umm* by Imam Shafi'i, is not quite right. This is because these books are more accurately called fiqh books, not hadith books. In addition, the error of orientalist in choosing the object of their study is that orientalist, especially Joseph Schacht, cannot distinguish between *Sirah* and hadith.⁴¹

Ali Mustafa Ya'qub hopes that in the future there will be *muhaddits* who can maintain the existence of hadith and can interpret hadith by the right understanding, not only selecting the authenticity or credibility of a hadith. Therefore, according to him, the study of contemporary hadith must consist of 4 elements, namely: *Mustalah al-Hadith*, *Takhrij Hadith* in the study of sanad, *Fiqh al-Hadith* as a means to understand hadith, and *Difa 'an al-Hadith* which is useful for maintaining the existence of hadith. from the hands of orientalist and dissenters. Therefore, he prepared the Darussunah Islamic Boarding School so that it could become a valuable asset to take part in teaching hadith with the correct understanding. ⁴² Ali Mustafa's critical attitude was much influenced by Mustafa al-Sibà'I (Master of the University of Damascus) who wrote the book *al-Sunnah wa Makânatuhà Fi al-Tasyri' al-Islami* (1949), Muhammad 'Ajaj al-Khatib who wrote the book *al-Mustafa. -Sunnah Qabla Tadwin* (1964), and Muhammad Mustafa al-'Azami (1932) wrote *Studies in Early Hadith Literature* (1966). Ali Mustafa was very impressed with their defense of the hadith of the Prophet. Mustafa al-Sibà'I is known for his courage and sportsmanship because he did not hesitate and was afraid to go directly to Joseph Schacht at Leiden University in the Netherlands to discuss Ignaz Goldziher's dishonesty and dishonesty in citing historical texts.⁴³

³⁷ Hasan Suadi, "Menyoal Kritik Sanad Joseph Schahct," *Riwayah Jurnal Studi Hadis*, 1 (2016), 95.

³⁸ Istianah dan Impala Kurnia, "Kritik Orientalis terhadap Hadits", 245-246.

³⁹ Adriansyah, "Shifting Paradigm" Pemahaman Hadits di Indonesia, 218.

⁴⁰ Istianah dan Shofaussamawati, "Kontribusi Ali Mustafa Yaqub (1952-2016)", 15.

⁴¹ Hasan Suadi, "Menyoal Kritik Sanad Joseph Schahct", 101.

⁴² Qomarullah "Pemahaman Hadits Ali Mustafa Yaqub dan Kontribusinya terhadap Pemikiran Hadits di Indonesia", 393.

⁴³ Ali Mustafa Yaqub, *Hadis-Hadis palsu seputar Ramadhan*, (Jakarta: Pustaka Firdaus, 2000), 122

CONCLUSION

Ali Mustafa Ya'qub in understanding a hadith, first tries to understand it textually. Furthermore, if it is not possible, it will be understood contextually. Ali Mustafa Ya'qub's method of understanding a hadith is by referring to the Takhrij hadith, namely by referring to the work of Mahmud Thahhan. In addition, he also often conducts ijtihad independently in determining the quality of hadith, namely by looking at the opinions of *mutaqaddin*, *mutaakhhirin* and contemporary scholars. His work entitled "Problematic Hadiths" is a work that is motivated by the anxiety of the community. His contribution, is to conduct studies on the orientalis Ignaz Goldziher, Juynboll, Joseph Schact, David Samuel Margolioth, and scholars who went against the tide. In addition, he also verified the hadith and founded the Darussunnah Islamic Boarding School in the hope that it would produce muhaddits and become a scholar in understanding hadith.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Adriansyah. "Shifting Paradigm" Pemahaman Hadits di Indonesia (Studi Interpretasi Kontekstual Ali Mustafa Ya'qub terhadap Hadits-Hadits Hubungan dengan Non-Muslim)." *Jurnal Agama Islam*, no. 2 (Desember, 2019). <https://doi.org/10.19109/jia.v20i2.5077>.
- Anggraeni, Dewi. "Toleransi antar Umat Beragama Perspektif KH. Ali Mustafa Yaqub." *Jurnal Studi Al-Qur'an Membangun Tradisi Berfikir Qur'an*, no. 1 (2018). <https://doi.org/10.21009/JSQ.014.1.05>.
- Azra, Azyumardi. *Jaringan Ulama' Timur Tengah dan Kepulauan Nusantara*. Jakarta: Prenada Media, 2005.
- Ismail, Syuhudi. *Hadis Nabi Yang Tekstual Dan Kontekstual Telaah Maani Tentang Ajaran Islam Yang Universal, Temporal Dan Lokal*, (Jakarta: Bulan Bintang, 1994).
- Istianah dan Shofaussamawati. "Kontribusi Ali Mustafa Yaqub (1952-2016) dalam Dinamika Kajian Hadits di Indonesia." *Riwayah: Jurnal Studi Hadits*, no. 1 (2017). <https://doi.org/10.21043/riwayah.v3i1.3442>.
- Karim, Abdul. "Pemikiran Orientalis Terhadap Kajian Tafsir Hadis," *Addin*, 2 (2013), 323.
- Kurnia, Impala dan Istianah. "Pandangan Ali Mustafa Taqub tentang Kritik Orientalis terhadap Hadits." *Riwayah: Jurnal Studi Hadits*, no. 2 (2019). <https://doi.org/10.21043/riwayah.v5i2.6140>.
- Kriyanto, Rachmat. *Teknik Praktisi Riset Komunikasi* (Jakarta: Kencana Pranada Group, 2007).
- Moleong, Lexy J. *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif* (Bandung: PT. Remaja Rosda Karya, 2007).
- Muhaimin, *Metode Penelitian Hukum* (Mataram: Mataram University Press, 2020).
- Miski. "Pemahaman Hadits Ali Mustafa Yaqub Studi atas Fatwa Pengharaman Serban dalam Konteks Indonesia," *Riwayah Jurnal Studi Hadits*, no. 1 (2016). <https://doi.org/10.21043/riwayah.v2i1.1625>.

doi: 10.35316/lisanalhal.V16i1.140-152

- Nadhiran, Hedhri. "Epistemologi Kritik Hadits," *Jurnal Ilmu Agama Mengkaji Doktrin Pemikiran dan Fenomena Agama*, no. 2 (Desember, 2017). <https://doi.org/10.19109/jia.v18i2.2363>.
- Nurdin, Nasrullah. "Prof Dr KH Ali Mustofa Ya'qub, MA, Muhaddis Nusantara Bertaraf Internasional." *Jurnal Lektur Keagamaan*, no. 1 (2016). <https://doi.org/10.31291/jlk.v14i1.481>.
- Qomarullah, Muhammad. "Pemahaman Hadits Ali Mustafa Yaqub dan Kontribusinya terhadap Pemikiran Hadits di Indonesia." *Al Quds Jurnal Studi Al-Quran dan Hadits*, no. 2 (2020). <https://doi.org/10.29240/alquds.v4i2.1862>.
- Ramadhan, M. Rizki Syahrul. "Metode Kritik Hadits Ali Mustafa Yaqub; Antara Teori dan Aplikasi." *Nabawi*, no. 1 (September, 2020).
- Suadi, Hasan. "Menyoal Kritik Sanad Joseph Schahct," *Riwayah Jurnal Studi Hadis*, 1 (2016).
- Waskito. *KH. Ali Mustafa Yaqub Menjaga Sunnah Mengawal Dakwah*. Jakarta: Pustaka Al-Kautsar: 2016.
- Ya'qub, Ali Mustafa. *Hadits-Hadits Bermasalah*. Jakarta: Pustaka Firdaus, 2008.
- Ya'qub, Ali Mustafa. *Hadits-Hadits Palsu Seputar Ramadan*. Jakarta: Pustaka Firdaus, 2003.
- Yunus, Muhammad. "Hadits tentang Arah Kiblat: Kritik Pemikiran Ali Mustafa Yaqub," *Jurnal Al-Irfani STAI Darul Kamal NW Kembang Kerang*, no. 1 (2020).
- "Kritik". Kamus Besar Bahasa Indonesia Online. <https://kbbi.web.id/kritik> diakses 25 Maret 2021.